Women and American Catholicism

Rationale

I teach this course regularly at the University of Notre Dame, a private, Roman Catholic institution with an undergraduate enrollment of 8,300. It is very important to consider this syllabus in institutional context, as I would probably organize it differently if I taught it at another college or university. Teaching the course at Notre Dame presents genuine opportunities and challenges. Among the former is the chance to teach and discuss Catholicism with talented students who tend to be very committed to understanding more about the history of the Church. The student body is approximately 85% Catholic, and I would estimate that my classes attract an even higher percentage of practicing Catholics. In terms of challenges, students are often uncomfortable with discussing the contested issues that inevitably surface in any course about women, gender, and Catholicism. In some cases, they are suspicious and even dismissive of any material that they interpret as dissent from or criticism of the magisterium. I deal with this challenge by emphasizing the importance of historical perspective, close attention to primary sources, and clear definitions. I also make very clear that we will be seeking to understand how controversial problems and questions have developed over time, not to solve or answer them.

There are not many venues on campus where students can engage in thoughtful and genuine discussion about women and the Catholic Church. In fact, I was encouraged to develop “Women and American Catholicism” several years ago by the director of Notre Dame’s Program in Gender Studies, in partial response to that problem. The course tends to attract students who fall into one of two categories. Members of the first and largest group are very devout Catholics who generally have a conservative attitude about women and the church. They are skeptical if not explicitly hostile toward feminism, and many of them are well-versed in and persuaded by the theology of Pope John Paul II, especially the “new feminism.” Members of the second, smaller group do self-identify as feminists, and while most consider themselves faithful Catholics, they are much more critical of the Church. At the very least, this interesting mix ensures that our discussions are spirited; at best, members of these two groups tend to move a little closer together over the course of the semester. Members of the former group, presented with evidence of the church’s historic marginalization of women, become a bit less inclined to discount feminist critiques. Students in the latter group, meanwhile, come to appreciate that women have always found sources of power and meaning within this patriarchal institution. By the end of the semester, both groups of students have realized that the subject of women in American Catholicism is much more complicated and interesting than caricatured understandings would indicate.

The course is primarily offered through the Department of History, and half of the thirty-five seats are reserved for history majors, for whom it counts as one of the required upper-level courses in U.S. history. Through an arrangement with the Program of Gender Studies, a number of the seats are reserved for Gender Studies majors. The course is also cross-listed with the departments of Theology and American Studies, and it fulfills a requirement for a concentration in “Education, Schooling and Society.”
Women and American Catholicism
History 30617
(ESS 378, Theo 385A, Amst 378H, GSC 375)

Fall 2006

Prof. Kathleen Sprows Cummings
Office: 1141 Flanner Hall (x1-8749)
Hours: Tuesday, 1:00-2:30, and by appt.
Email: kcumming@nd.edu

Office: O’Shaughnessy 116
MWF 10:40-11:30

COURSE DESCRIPTION:

This course is a history of American Catholic women from the colonial period to the present. Through a combination of lectures, reading and discussion, we will explore, among others, the following themes: the role of religious belief and practice in shaping Catholics’ understanding of gender differences; the experience of women in religious communities and in family life; women’s involvement in education and social reform; ethnic and racial diversity among Catholic women; devotional life; the development of feminist theology, and the emergence of the “new feminism” as articulated by Pope John Paul II. We will seek to understand how Catholic women, both lay and religious, contributed to the development of Church and nation, and examine how encounters with the broader American society have shaped Catholic women’s relationship to the institutional church over the last three centuries.

The class format will involve discussion of assigned primary and secondary sources, supplemented by occasional background lectures. We will take several “field trips,” including a visit to the Notre Dame Archives for a presentation on Catholic material culture, a tour of the Basilica of the Sacred Heart to enhance our understanding of devotional life before the Second Vatican Council, and an evening at St. Peter Claver Catholic Worker House in South Bend. Note: Discussions of women, gender and Catholicism invariably include controversial issues. I insist that you treat all members of this class, including those with whom you disagree, with respect. Please also keep in mind that, as historians, we will be seeking to understand how controversial problems and questions have developed over time, not to solve or answer them.

A more detailed description of each of the six units:

I. Catholic Gender Ideology

On the first day, we review the distinction between sex and gender. I borrow the title of Stephanie Shaw’s book on African-American professional workers, What a Woman Ought to Be and Do, to encourage the students to think about the various factors that shape the meaning that
any particular group attaches to biological difference. Among these, of course, is religious belief. We read examples of Catholic prescriptive literature from the late nineteenth century to the present to see how Catholic gender ideology has been constructed.

II. Making Saints

Students who expect something hagiographic in this unit are often surprised. As we ask, “who becomes a saint, and why?,” we will discover that the answers depend less on individual’s piety than on a host of political, ecclesial and economic considerations. After reading a chapter from Kenneth Woodward’s *Making Saints*, we explore the first three American saints, all of whom were women and all of whom were members of religious communities. Next we turn to pending saints: Mother Theodore Guerin, who will be canonized in fall 2006 (I am trying to arrange a visit from a member of her community to discuss the process); Blessed Kateri Tekakwitha, who provides an excellent example of how saints can be appropriated to serve other causes; and Dorothy Day, who reportedly scoffed at the prospect of her own canonization, saying “I don’t want to be so easily dismissed.” Citing this, some of her supporters oppose making her a saint, saying it would both devalue her significance and diminish the power of her example. In addition to reading primary and secondary sources about Day, students will view *Entertaining Angels*, a 1996 film which dramatizes Dorothy’s Day’s sexual relationships with men and her abortion before she converted to Catholicism, and spend an evening at the Catholic Worker house in South Bend, where they hear one of the residents speak to the class about “Dorothy’s” continuing influence over the ministry.

III. Women Religious

By discussing Cabrini, Seton, Drexel, and Guerin, we will have already laid the foundations for this unit, which begins with the arrival of the Ursulines in New Orleans in 1727. Themes and topics explored in this unit include: race, anti-Catholicism, the exceptional growth, both in size and number, of women’s religious communities over the nineteenth century; and nuns as teachers and nurses. We use two of Hoy’s chapters to explore how sisters – many of them Irish immigrants -- developed a variety of creative responses to the needs of the local church, founding and staffing schools, hospitals, homes for working women, homes for the aged, orphanages, employment agencies, and home health care organizations. The unit ends with a discussion of two readings intended to spark discussion about continuity and change (the students turn in a reflection paper on this subject). We will return to the theme of women’s religious life in the final unit. Meanwhile, students will select and interview a real-live woman religious (see assignments).

IV. Family and Devotional Life

Shifting the focus from women in religious communities, the class now explores the history of Catholic lay women through the twin lenses of family and devotional life. A key part of this unit is our visit to the University Archives, where archivist Kevin Cawley leads the class through a
collection of Catholic material culture. Although devotions like the rosary are resurging in popularity among younger Catholics, most students have not seen scapulars or other once-common elements of Catholic devotional life.

Next we turn to Marian Devotion. As historian Joseph Chinnici observed, devotions to Mary often tells us more about the devotees than they do about the mother of Jesus. I always emphasize to the students that, by recognizing this, we are not calling into question either the efficacy of the devotions themselves or the faithfulness of the people who practice them. Rather, we are simply acknowledging that devotions become popular within specific cultural, political and contexts, and that they can be used to serve particular purposes. After discussing Our Lady of Guadalupe, we turn to Lourdes, which has a substantial local interest. Edward Sorin C.S.C., the founder of Notre Dame, played a central role in popularizing American devotion to Lourdes. In 1865, he founded the journal *Ave Maria*, which quickly became one of the most popular Catholic publications in America. In 1877, a replica at the grotto at Lourdes was constructed on Notre Dame’s campus. Father Sorin also cornered the market on the importation of bottled water from the spring at Lourdes, which became a highly desired commodity among Catholics suffering from a variety of ailments. Father Peter Rocca leads the class on a tour of the Basilica and the Grotto, an exact replica of the grotto at Lourdes. Between his careful explanations and the historical context, even students who have made hundreds of visits to these places learn something new.

After exploring immigration, ethnicity and devotional life with readings from Orsi, Nabhan-Warren and the film *Household Saints*, we end this unit with a look at representations of Mary that idealize Catholic women as wives and mothers. This provides a nice segue into our next unit.

**V. Catholicism and the Body**

In this unit we explore several of the most of the highly-contested issues in American Catholicism, past and present: contraception, sexuality, abortion. Students have very passionate opinions on these subjects, and I try to diffuse the invariably volatile discussions by stressing the importance of primary documents and historical context. On a more lighthearted note, we spend three days discussing Byrne’s *O God of Players*, which is about Catholic women playing basketball and having fun between 1930 and 1975.

**VI. Transformations in Church and Society**

The decrees of the Second Vatican Council (1962-65) shifted Catholics’ understanding of themselves, both as men and women within the Church and in relation to the larger society. In the United States, of course, that society was itself being transformed by the civil rights movement, the re-emergence of feminism, and the Vietnam War. In this unit we will explore how these twin developments -- the reforms of Vatican II and broader cultural change -- shaped the experience of American Catholic women in the 1960s and beyond. We explore the development of feminist theology as well as the question of Catholic women in ordained and non-ordained ministry. This year I have also added a class on missionary sisters, many of whom were and are influenced by liberation theology. We examine the cases of the four women

We end the unit, and the course, with a discussion of Catholicism and its relationship to contemporary feminism and anti-feminism. We devote one class period to exploring the ubiquitous, “I am not a feminist, but....” in the context of the class. Returning to the documents we read at the beginning of the course, we discuss Pope John Paul II and the “new feminism.”

**READING:**

The following books are required and available at the University of Notre Dame Bookstore. They are also on reserve in Hesburgh Library.


Paula Kane, James Kenneally, and Karen Kennelly, eds. *Gender Identities in American Catholicism* (Orbis, 2001) (This is a volume in the American Catholic Identities Documentary series edited by Christopher Kaufmann, which provides students with remarkable access to over one hundred primary documents).

Required articles (designated by an “*” on the course schedule) are compiled in a course packet that is available for purchase at the Decio Copy Center (Rm. 235 Decio). Price is **$17.00**.

Articles in course packet include:


Web sites:


Mary Ann Glendon, “The Pope’s New Feminism,”

“The Amazing Grace of Dorothy Stang,” 2006
http://www.sndden.org/where/latin/brazil/stang/index.html

Kathleen Sprows Cummings, “Change of Habit,” 2003
http://www.nd.edu/~ndmag/au2003/cummings.html
http://www.vatican.va/holy_father/john_paul_ii/letters/documents/hf_j

Molly Lyons, “Why Am I Still a Part of this Church?” 
http://www.bustedhalo.com/spirituality/features19.htm

Molly Lyons,

**REQUIREMENTS:**

Students must be familiar with and act in accordance with the University of Notre Dame’s Honor Code. Students will be evaluated based on the following:

**Class Participation (25%):**
The class participation grade will be based on attendance and informed contributions to class discussions. Students are expected to arrive at class prepared to engage questions and issues raised in the assigned reading. Students with three or more unexcused absences during the semester (including field trips) will be penalized at least a full letter grade on their class participation grade.

**Written Assignments (50%):**

**Reflection Papers: (4, 2-3pp. 5% each):**

Reflection papers must be two to three pages in length (typed, double-spaced). Students must turn in 4 of 5 papers.

#1 (due August 28): What a (Catholic) Woman Ought to Be and Do. Analyze and reflect upon one of the assigned documents or a document that you have located on your own. Questions you might consider are whether the author conflates sex and gender, or what the document reveals about the gap between image and reality in the lives of American Catholic women.

#2 (due September 13): Pending Saint. Locate an example of woman who is being considered for sainthood in the Catholic Church (she need not be American). At what stage is her cause? Who are her promoters? What case do they make?

#3 (due October 4): Continuity and Change in Religious Life. The authors of the two assigned articles both emphasize continuity between the contemporary activities of women religious and the work they have done in the American past. Do you agree, or would you argue that change has been a more operative force in the history of American nuns?

#4 (due October 27): Marian Devotion. Historian Joseph Chinnici observed that devotions to Mary often tell us more about the devotees than they do about the mother of Jesus. Evaluate a contemporary devotion to Mary in the light of Chinnici’s comment.

# 5(due Nov. 12): History and the Power of Place. Hoy and Byrne each ground their studies in a particular place (Chicago and Philadelphia, respectively). Think about writing a history of a
place you know well. What makes it unique? What makes it representative? Where would you begin?

Vocation Narrative (5-6 pp, 20%):

Vocation Narrative
Women and American Catholicism

Due: December 8

Step 1: Choose a subject. I have compiled a list of women at Notre Dame, at Saint Mary’s and in South Bend who have agreed to be interviewed on this subject. Only one student per person, please. (Alternatively, you may choose to interview someone who is not on the list, provided that the interview will be conducted in person). If you like, you may interview in pairs, and write a comparative study. Please contact your subjects by October 8 to set up the interview, and schedule the interview by November 12. Allow at least 30 minutes for the interview. Use your phone/email conversation to get basic details, such as the community they are a part of (ie, Franciscan, Dominican, Holy Cross), and the date they entered religious life.

Step 2: Prepare for the interview. I have placed Why I Entered the Convent (1953), edited by George Kane, on reserve in Hesburgh Library. Read three of four of the reflections to get a sense of why those particular authors chose religious life. Note interesting details that you may want to ask your own subject about. Use these stories, as well as our class discussions, to devise your own questions. Examples may include, but are not limited to:

- When did you know you wanted to enter religious life? How old were you when you entered?
- Why did you choose this particular congregation? How was your decision received by family members? How long have you been in religious life? How has it changed over the years?
- What have been some challenges? What kind of ministry have you worked in? Are the reasons you entered the same reasons why you stayed? What surprised you about religious life?

You should also prepare by finding out some basic information about the community of which your subject is a member, and by considering the year they entered. Was it before or after the Second Vatican Council (1962-65), for example? This will also help you to devise questions.

Step 3: Conduct the interview. Plan to spend at least 30 minutes with your subject. Take good notes!

Step 4: Write the paper. Your paper must be approximately 6 pages in length (at least two pages longer if you choose to do a comparative study). It will be evaluated based on how well it is written and how well it conveys the story of your subject. Primarily, though, it will be evaluated on how well you situate your subject’s individual story within a larger context. In other words, what does your subject teach us about the history of nuns in the U.S.? About the history of women? About the history of Catholicism? To do this correctly, you will need to spend some time before the interview thinking about the time period in which they entered religious life. If it was before the Second Vatican Council, for example, it will be important to ask them how the
Council affected them and their communities. If they have entered relatively recently, it will be important to ask them about where they see the future of American women’s religious life.

Note: Students often approach this assignment with trepidation. Twenty years ago, it would have been virtually inconceivable that a student could come to Notre Dame without having met a women religious, but that is often the case these days. The students always enjoy their interviews, and they are often surprised to meet faithful and vibrant women living a life they had dismissed as outmoded. One young woman put it this way: "Going into the interview I wondered what in the world I could possibly have in common with a nun. After speaking with Sister Mary Ann I realized that if I was lucky, everything." This young woman had earlier confessed that her growing feminist sensibilities were coming into increasing conflict with what she had been taught during her strict Catholic upbringing.

Because I require that the students conduct their interviews by November 12, students already have a great deal of background information before they approach our discussion on the transformation of religious life after Vatican II.

I have heard it said that it would not be feasible for professors to assign this at universities where there is unlikely to be a preponderance of women religious. Observing the resourcefulness of my students, I disagree. While it is true that many interviewed their rectors, ND faculty members, or sisters that I happened to know, others contacted women through their home parishes. Several located interview subjects through the Internet. One student spent a whole day with a contemplative Benedictine community in Ohio. The first time I assigned this, I provided a list of women with whom I had already spoken about the assignment and who had already consented to be interviewed. I am going to omit that this time; it was a lot of work for me, and was really unnecessary in the end.

Examinations (25%): The College of Arts and Letters requires me to administer a final exam. final has been scheduled by for December 16 at 8:00 a.m.

COURSE SCHEDULE:

Unit One: Catholic Gender Ideology

August 23 Introduction to Course

August 25 What a (Catholic) Women Ought to Be and Do
Doc. 25: Advice for Young Catholic Women, 1887
Doc. 29: Inferiority of Body and Soul, 1914
Doc. 30: “Rest Content with the Position God Has Ordained, 1906
http://www.vatican.va/holy_father/john_paul_ii/letters/documents/hf_j

Optional: John Paul II, Mulieris Dignitatem (1988)  

Reflection # 1 Due

Unit Two: Making Saints

August 30  Canonization: Who, How, and Why?  
Kenneth Woodward, “The Local Politics of Sainthood”

Sept. 1  American Firsts: Elizabeth Seton, Frances Cabrini, Katherine Drexel

Sept. 4  Kateri Tekakwitha: Patron Saint of Conservation and Native Americans  
*Cholenec, “Remembrance of Kateri Tekakwitha, the Saintly Mohawk”

Sept. 6  Mother Theodore Guerin  
Doc. 10: A Bishop Abuses His Authority, 1844  
Guest: Sister Kevin Marie, S.P.

Sept 8  Dorothy Day  
*Ellsburg, “Introduction”  
*Day, “Therese”  
Doc. 51: Day, We Continue our Christian Pacifist Stand, 1942  
Doc. 48: Day, Men and Women Differing and Complementing, 1968

Evening Visit to St. Peter Claver Catholic Worker House

Sept. 11  Film: Entertaining Angels

Sept. 13  Pending Causes  
Doc. 44: Mary Gordon, Saints as Role Models, 1991

Reflection # 2 Due

Unit Three: Women Religious

Sept. 15  Foundations of Women’s Religious Life

Sept. 18  *Clark, “Peculiar Professionals: The Financial Strategies of the New Orleans’ Ursulines”
*Morrow, *Persons of Color and Religious at the Same Time*

Sept. 20  
*Schultz, *Fire and Roses*

Sept. 22  
Hoy, “The Journey Out: From Ireland to America”
Doc. 14: German Redemptorist Finds an Irish Nuns’ Leadership Intolerable, 1880

Sept. 27  
Hoy, “Walking Nuns: Chicago’s Irish Sisters of Mercy”

Sept. 29  
Doc. 57: Contract Negotiations for Parochial Schools, 1867
Doc. 58: Let Women Be Educated Carefully, 1874
Doc. 64: Tending Cholera Victims, 1856
Doc. 65: Sisters Nursing Civil War Soldiers, 1862-6
Doc. 66: Angels of Mercy at the Battle of Vicksburg, 1863
Doc. 67: Yellow Fever Outbreaks, 1878-82

Oct. 2  

Oct. 4  
Lyons, “Why Am I Still a Part of this Church?”
http://www.bustedhalo.com/spirituality/features19.htm
Cummings, “Change of Habit”
http://www.nd.edu/~ndmag/au2003/cummings.html

**Reflection # 3 Due**

**Unit Four: Family and Devotional Life**

Oct. 6  
Guadalupe

Oct. 9  
**Tour of Basilica of the Sacred Heart**

Oct. 11  
Lourdes to Fatima

Oct. 13  
Film: *Household Saints*

Oct. 16-20  
Fall Break

Oct. 23  
*Orsi, *Madonna of 115th Street*, pp. 129-149
Film: *The Moveable Feast*

Oct. 25  

**Reflection # 4 Due**
Oct. 27  Wives and Mothers
Doc. 37: The Virgin Mother, 1882
Doc. 38: On the Meaning of Mary, 1934
Doc. 4: Chicago Pre-Cana Conference, 1950
Doc. 6: New Rituals for Expectant Mothers, 1957
Doc. 7: Happy Little Wives and Mothers, 1956
Doc. 19: “Filling the Husband’s Need,” 1963

**Unit Five: Catholicism and the Body**

Oct. 30  Contraception
Doc. 18: Six Aren’t Enough, 1953
Doc. 87: The Duties of Confessors with Regard to Contraception, 1928

Nov. 1  Sexuality
Doc. 31: On Sowing Wild Oats, 1915
Doc. 32: Advice to Boys from a Priest, 1947
Doc. 33: Advice to Girls from a Priest, 1948
Doc. 40: “Marylike Codes are Prudish,” 1955
Doc. 39: Marylike Code of Attire for Church and Other Sacred Places, 1960
Doc. 20: American Catholic Dating Guidelines, 1963
Doc. 9: Are You Really in Love?, 1965

Nov. 3  Homosexuality
Doc. 110: A Sister Cofounds a New Ministry, 1985
Doc. 111: Dignity USA Statement of Purpose
Doc. 112: Pastoral Letter on Homosexuality, 1980
Doc. 114: The Joseph Foundation, 2000

Nov. 6  Byrne, *O God of Players,* chap. 1-2

Nov. 8  Byrne, *O God of Players,* chap. 3-4

Nov. 10:  Byrne, *O God of Players,* chap. 5-6

Nov. 12  Politics of Abortion and Birth Control
Doc. 89: The Papal Commission and Women on the Rhythm Method of Birth Control, 1995
Doc. 90: “Statement on Abortion Advertisement,” 1986
Doc. 91: Sister Agnes Mansour Forced to Leave the Sisters of Mercy, 1983
Doc. 93: “A Catholic Woman’s Political Saga,” 1985
Traxler to O’Brien, 3 January 1977 (handout)
New York Times Ad, October 7, 1984 (handout)

Reflection # 5 Due

Unit 6: Transformations in Church and Society

Nov. 15  Vatican II and the Transformation of Women’s Religious Life
   *Gramick, “From Good Sisters to Prophetic Women”
   National Coalition of American Nuns, Declaration of Independence for Women, 1972 (handout)
   Doc. 86: Vatican II’s Call for Renewal Revolutionizes Religious Life, 1985
   Doc. 82: Nuns Experience a New Sense of Identity as Women, 1988

Nov. 17:  Hoy, “Missionary Sisters in Black Belt Neighborhoods,”
   Hoy, “No Color Line at Loretto Academy”

Nov. 20  Women Religious and Civil Rights
   Hoy, “Marching for Racial Justice in Chicago in the 1960s”
   Traxler, “After Selma, Sister, You can’t Go Home Again” 1965 (handout)
   Doc. 53: “Nuns at Selma,” 1965

Nov. 22  Missionaries and Martyrs
   Doc. 83: “Nuns Identify Mission as Integral to their Identity,” 1988
   “The Amazing Grace of Sister Dorothy Stang,” 2005
   http://www.sndden.org/where/latin/brazil/stang/index.html

Nov. 24:  Thanksgiving Break

Nov. 27:  Catholic Women in Ministry
   *LaCugna, “Catholic Women as Ministers and Theologians”
   Doc. 120: “The Ordination of Women,” 1975
   Ware, Perplexed Thoughts Upon Leaving the Church after Mass, 1977 (handout)
   Kane, Statement to Pope John Paul II, 1979 (handout)

Nov. 29  Feminist Theology
   Doc. 116: Ruether, WomanChurch Calls Men to Free Patriarchy, 1984
   Doc. 117: Daly, “A Feminist Postchristian Revisits Herself, 1985
   *Hayes, “Challenge of Black Women in the Church”
   *Johnson, “Mary, Friend of God and Prophet”

Dec. 1   Resistance and Reaction
   Doc. 107: Schlafly Interview with Ms. Magazine, 1982

Dec. 4  “I’m Not a Feminist, But….”

Dec. 6  Pope John Paul and the New Feminists
* Kaveny, “What Women Want: Buffy, the Pope and the New Feminists”
  Glendon, “The New Feminism”

Dec. 8  Vocation Narratives Due

Dec. 16  **FINAL EXAM**  8:00a.m