Spiritual But Not Religious: Making Spirituality in America

Daniel Vaca Brown University

Institutional and Curricular Context

Brown University is a private research university in Providence, Rhode Island. Founded in 1764, it currently enrolls 6,580 undergraduates, 2,255 graduate students, and 545 medical students. The majority of those students come from outside Rhode Island. About 19% of undergraduates come from historically underrepresented groups, while approximately 43% of undergraduates identify as white. During the past few years, the university has developed a variety of initiatives designed to cultivate a more diverse student body and faculty; yet the student body remains especially disproportionate with regard to socioeconomic privilege and class. Brown ranks high for the proportion of its student body whose families earn among the top 20% of average family income (70% of students). Despite these problems, Brown often is described as the most "liberal" of the universities in the Ivy League, and the campus's culture generally embraces that reputation by championing progressive ideas, issues, and initiatives.

A hallmark of Brown's undergraduate experience is its "open curriculum." This essentially means that there are no core courses that a student must take. Although a liberal arts institution in theory, the actual practice of that theory depends upon the individual student. The only curricular requirements are a writing requirement and the requirements imposed by a student's concentration. Students are free to take whatever courses beyond their concentrations that they choose, and the university encourages the spirit of choice by dubbing the first two weeks of each semester the "shopping period." As this phrase suggests, the consumer logic of course selection leads students to "shop" a wide range of courses, and it encourages faculty to design courses that appeal to students' varied personal, academic, and professional interests.

One frequently aired criticism of this particular consumer culture is that faculty are obliged to "give them what they want, not what they need." This criticism is especially seductive in an era when enrollments in the humanities and the numbers of concentrators in humanities departments have declined significantly from decades past. This fact leads faculty sometimes to lament that the university has encouraged students to value STEM fields more than the humanities. The relatively wealthy composition of the student body also fuels the worry that the open curriculum allows students to perpetuate their socioeconomic privilege without confronting the critiques they would encounter through the historical, cultural, and philosophical inquiry that humanities courses often emphasize. These criticisms notwithstanding, the productive challenge of the open curriculum and students' consumer approach to it is that faculty must constantly reconsider the purpose of the courses considered common to their fields.

This reconsideration has been a challenge especially in my departmental context. When I arrived at Brown in 2013, no faculty member in Religious Studies had taught around American religion for well over a decade, while just one faculty member in the History Department (former Young Scholar Linford Fisher) offered some related courses, including a two-semester survey of religion in American history. As a result, I have had freedom to develop courses beyond the survey, which has made every course an opportunity to consider how to negotiate the concerns and challenges I have described.

Pedagogical Approach

This course took shape initially out of a desire to create a course that would serve as an introduction both to American religion and Religious Studies as an academic discipline. Having taught it a few times, I still envision and approach the course this way. Our department does not

currently have an "Introduction to Religion" course, and this course accordingly addresses some of the conceptual issues that general introductions often explore.

The course's theme also reflects the religious culture of Brown's campus. Whereas faculty at some universities in the United States might presume that many or even most students have a working knowledge of or interest in Christianity, I have not always found that to be true at Brown. But many students do claim some sort of "spiritual" identity or interest. And so the course takes that identity as a starting point.

The premise of the course is to ask why "spirituality" and "religion" is a distinction that means something to us. After beginning the course by exploring some of the common perceptions, presumptions, and statistics associated with the concept of spirituality, the first section of the course explores a variety of critiques of "religion." The point of this first section is to show how many of the ideas and activities commonly understood as "spirituality" regularly have developed out of settings recognized as "organized religion." In the second section of the course, however, students come to see how ostensibly spiritual ideas and practices are not unorganized; to the contrary, they take shape through a wide range of institutions and social formations. By training students to recognize how categories like "spirituality" and "religion" come to describe shifting features of social life, the course not only demonstrates how the study of "religion" encompasses a far wider range of activity than students often realize but also invites students to think anew about all of the concepts and categories they use to define and orient their worlds.

The course's themes and readings always remain subject to revision. I regularly update the readings, as the framework of the course provides an opportunity to read and teach fascinating new work in our field. Every time I have offered the course, new work has appeared recently that speaks directly to issues I previously addressed through a pastiche of readings. In a previous iteration of the course, I assigned primary sources for every class meeting; in the current iteration, students read secondary sources in preparation for two of the three weekly meetings. These readings enable students to engage related primary sources both in class and in the discussion sections that accompany the course's larger meetings. This syllabus also includes some of the online articles that I provide to help students draw connections between academic analysis and their everyday lives.

Spiritual But Not Religious (RELS 0056): Making Spirituality in America

Spring 2017

Professor Daniel Vaca Class meetings: M/W/F, 10.00-10.50am

Email: daniel_vaca@brown.edu Class location: TBD

Office: 59 George Street, Room 302 Teaching Assistant: TBD

Office hours: TBD



Course Description

When people call themselves "spiritual," what does that mean? This introductory course answers that question by exploring the wide range of ideas, practices, and desires that have come to make up the concept of spirituality. Inviting students to consider why spirituality seems "not religious," this course examines such phenomena as yoga, faith healing, hip hop, shopping, self-help books, psychology, surveys, and protest movements. By studying these sites of spirituality, this course will enable students to recognize how Americans have made sense of their own lives and institutional attachments through continually changing technologies of race, pluralism, science, capitalism, and secularism.

This course will meet weekly on Mondays and Wednesdays for lecture; on Fridays, students will meet in smaller discussion sections to discuss the week's primary themes.

Course Objectives

This course's lectures, discussion sections, readings, and assignments are designed to work toward the following objectives:

- 1. Introduce students to the history of ideas, practices, and desires that shape popular understandings of religion and spirituality
- 2. Attune students to the ways that categories like "religion" and "spirituality" orient how we perceive other people and ourselves
- 3. Enable students to engage depictions of religion and spirituality in their everyday lives and in popular media
- 4. Sharpen students' ability to identify and interrogate the key issues of primary and secondary texts
- 5. Enhance students' ability to ask and answer critical questions about complex historical trends and cultural tensions

Course Requirements

1. Attendance and participation (10%)

Both in lectures and in discussion sections, our collaborative conversations about the readings and issues at hand represent the heart of this course. Your presence is essential to its success. You should read the assignments with care and reflection. Recurring (unexcused) absences and lack of preparation will be penalized. If you are uncomfortable talking in class or otherwise concerned about your participation, please consult with Professor Vaca by the second week of the course, and we will find alternative means for you to participate.

2. Discussion responses (20%)

For at least six discussion sections (with at least two no-questions-asked skips), you will be required to prepare a brief response in preparation for your discussion section. Your response will help shape the direction of our class discussion. It also will help sharpen your analytical and writing skills by allowing you to engage critically with our course readings and class conversations.

In 200-300 words (for reference, this current paragraph is approximately 100 words), your response should identify issues that you found particularly interesting, important, perplexing, or worthy of further conversation. In addition to your general comments, your response should include: 1) at least one question that you would be prepared to share in section, and 2) at least one specific reference to an assigned reading. The best responses and questions will enable you and your fellow students not only to think critically about the week's readings but also to identify and engage the week's larger themes. To facilitate conversation, you will post your responses to Canvas by 9am on the morning of your section meeting.

If you cannot be present on the day of a discussion section meeting, you will be required to write a longer reading response (400-600 words), which discusses at least two readings from the week.

3. Take-home midterm examination (30%)

The midterm will be due Monday, March 19. It will comprise short identifications and an essay, which you will select from several choices. The identifications and essay prompts will be distributed at least week before the exam is due.

4. Syllabus suggestion (in two parts: 10% for proposal; 30% for final assignment)

Both because this course surveys a lot of thematic terrain and because "spirituality" is an expansive concept, we inevitably will not devote enough—or any—time to an issue that you would like to have studied. The assignment therefore is to select a thing, place, group, or phenomenon that you find relevant to the study of spirituality, and to write a short paper (7-8 pages) that justifies your selection. Your paper not only will explain why your selection merits attention with regard to your understanding of spirituality but also will suggest where in the course we might have taken up your suggestion and how we might have done so. In short, think of this assignment as your opportunity to use the course as an excuse to explore something that interests you, as well as a chance to leave your mark on the course's future. Make your case!

This assignment will be completed in two parts. First, by April 4, you will turn in a 2-3 page proposal. Second, by May 11, you will turn in your final assignment. We will provide you with more information about this assignment later in the semester.

Course Readings

All course readings are available on OCRA (Online Course Reserves Access). As you will see in the "Course Schedule" section of the syllabus, I have listed the readings for each class meeting. The readings include both secondary sources (i.e., academic or journalistic studies of a topic) as well as a primary sources (i.e., sources created by practitioners in the past or present). Note that for most weeks, I have provided "further reading" in addition to the required readings. These readings are not required; they are suggestions for additional reading, in case your interests or assignments leave you wanting to explore our themes further.

Altogether, the readings for any given session rarely exceed approximately 30 pages. To indicate that you will be reading only a portion of a particular reading, I have described most readings from portions of books as "Selections from" I also have flagged limited page number ranges when appropriate (e.g., "Portion of Chapter 3 (just 150-165"), or simply removed pages from PDFs that I have posted to OCRA.

To annotate and organize your pdfs, I recommend that you select a PDF reader and organizer early in the semester. Options for reading include Adobe Acrobat, which you have free access to through Brown's CIS, as well as a range of free readers for PC or Mac (e.g., Skim; Preview). For organizing pdfs and managing citations, options include Endnote (through CIS), and the free and open-source Zotero.

If you would like to supplement lectures and assigned readings with a broader overview of alternative religions in American history, you might consult the following ebook:

Albanese, Catherine L. <u>A Republic of Mind and Spirit: A Cultural History of American Metaphysical Religion</u>. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2007.

Classroom Guidelines

- 1. If any student has any concerns about accessibility and would like to discuss accommodations to disabilities, impairments, or other limits, please bring your concerns to Professor Vaca over email or during office hours.
- 2. Laptops are allowed in the classroom, but use of them is discouraged for any purpose other than taking notes or consulting course readings. As <u>research on learning outcomes</u> demonstrates, laptops present problems largely because the tendency to multitask is difficult to

- resist, yet multitasking disrupts concentration and distracts others in ways that hinder conversation.
- 3. The use of laptops/phones/tablets for browsing the web or messaging is very highly discouraged. Please use this class as an opportunity to curb your electronic addiction!

Course Schedule

Note: This schedule always is subject to revision, depending on the direction of our class conversations and student interests

Introduction

W: January 24: Introduction

F: January 26: What Is Spirituality?

Selections from Mercadante, Linda A. *Belief without Borders: Inside the Minds of the Spiritual but Not Religious*. New York: Oxford, 2014. Portions of Introduction (1-7) and Chapter 4 ("Common Themes," 68-91).

Peters, Micah. "Kendrick Is Risen." The Ringer, April 16, 2017.

Further reading:

Miller, Monica R. "No Church in the Wild': The Youth's Unrecognized Spirituality Between Beats and Rhymes." *Huffington Post*, August 14, 2012.

M: January 29: Organization, Affiliation, and Its Discontents

Wuthnow, Robert. "In Polls We Trust." First Things: A Monthly Journal of Religion & Public Life, no. 255 (September 8, 2015): 39–44.

Lipka, Michael. "<u>5 Key Findings about Religiosity in the U.S. – and How It's Changing</u>." *Pew Research Center*, November 3, 2015.

Further reading:

Wuthnow, Robert. Inventing American Religion: Polls, Surveys, and the Tenuous Quest for a Nation's Faith. New York: Oxford University Press, 2015.

Green, Emma. "The Futility of Representing Religion With a Bar Chart." The Atlantic, November 1, 2015.

W: January 31: "Spirituality" and Not "Religion"?

Martin, Craig. "Studying Religion: Laying the Groundwork." In *A Critical Introduction to the Study of Religion*, 1–18. Oxford: Routledge, 2014.

Manseau, Peter. "Thou Shalt Worship None of the Above." New York Times, May 16, 2015.

Further reading:

Smith, Jonathan Z. "Religion, Religions, Religious." In *Critical Terms for Religious Studies*, edited by Mark C. Taylor, 269–84. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1998.

Lofton, Kathryn. Consuming Religion. Chicago, Ill.: University of Chicago Press, 2017. Preface and Introduction.

Stoddard, Brad, and Craig Martin, eds. Stereotyping Religion: Critiquing Clichés. New York: Bloomsbury Academic, 2017.

F: February 2: Revising Religion?

Selections from Harris, Sam. Waking Up: A Guide to Spirituality Without Religion. New York: Simon & Schuster, 2013.

Selections from Adler, Felix. *The Essentials of Spirituality*. New York: J. Pott & Co., 1905. *Further reading:*

Selection from Ward, Lester F. "The Essential Nature of Religion." *International Journal of Ethics* 8, no. 2 (January 1898): 169–92.

Part I: Opposing Religion

As the phrase "spiritual, but not religious" suggests, we often think about spirituality in opposition to "religion." In Part I, we explore forms of "organized" or "institutional" religion that have solicited opposition and inspired modes of religious life commonly seen as "spirituality."

Individualism vs. Cultural Hegemony

M: February 5: Critiquing Orthodoxy

Selections from Schmidt, Leigh Eric. Restless Souls: The Making of American Spirituality. San Francisco: HarperSanFrancisco, 2005. Portion of Introduction (just 1-14).

Vaca, Daniel. "Transcendentalism." In *Encyclopedia of Religion in America*, edited by Charles H. Lippy and Peter W. Williams, 2205–11. Washington, D.C: CQ Press, 2010.

Emerson, Ralph Waldo. "A Sermon Delivered before the Senior Class in Divinity College, Cambridge, Sunday Evening, July 15, 1838" (a.k.a., "The Divinity School Address).

W: February 7: Critiquing Patriarchy

Selections from Fuller, Margaret. "The Great Lawsuit. Man versus Men. Woman versus Women." *The Dial* (July 1843).

Crouse, Jamie S. "If They Have a Moral Power': Margaret Fuller, Transcendentalism, and the Question of Women's Moral Nature." *ATQ* 19, no. 4 (December 2005): 259–79

Further reading:

Adams, Katherine. "Black Exaltadas: Race, Reform, and Spectacular Womanhood after Fuller." ESQ: A Journal of the American Renaissance 57, no. 1 (2011): 135–63.

Robinson, David M. "Margaret Fuller, New York, and the Politics of Transcendentalism." *ESQ: A Journal of the American Renaissance* 52, no. 4 (2006): 271–99.

F: February 9: First Discussion Sections

Experience vs. Rational Religion

M: February 12: Seeking Spirit

Selections from Swedenborg, Emanuel. "Heaven and Hell." In *Swedenborg Sampler*. West Chester, PA, USA: Swedenborg Foundation Publishers, 2011.

Selections from Clark, Emily Suzanne. A Luminous Brotherhood: Afro-Creole Spiritualism in Nineteenth-Century New Orleans. Chapel Hill, N.C.: University of North Carolina Press, 2016.

Further reading:

Selection from Schmidt, Leigh Eric. Hearing Things: Religion, Illusion, and the American Enlightenment. Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press, 2000. Chapter 5 ("Voices from Spirit-Lane").

W: February 14: Experiencing Spirit

James, William. Varieties of Religious Experience: A Study in Human Nature. 1902. Lecture II ("Circumscription of the Topic").

Luhrmann, Tanya M. "The Art of Hearing God: Absorption, Dissociation, and Contemporary American Spirituality." *Spiritus: A Journal of Christian Spirituality* 5, no. 2 (2005): 133–57.

F: February 16: Discussion Section

M: February 19: Long weekend. No class.

Identities vs. Institutions

W: February 21: Catholic Crises

Selections from O'Toole, James M. *The Faithful A History of Catholics in America*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 2010.

Oakes, Kaya. "How to Make Nones and Lose Money: Study Shows Cost of Catholic Sex Abuse Scandals." *Religion Dispatches*, September 21, 2015.

F: February 23: Evangelical Disillusionment

Selections from DeRogatis, Amy. Saving Sex: Sexuality and Salvation in American Evangelicalism. New York: Oxford University Press, 2014.

Chellew-Hodge, Candace. "Pew Confirms LGBT Rejection of Religion: Why That's a Good Thing." Religion Dispatches, May 12, 2015.

Turner, Matthew Paul. "Counterattacking the Gay Evangelical." The Daily Beast, April 27, 2014.

Further reading:

Oakes, Kaya. The Nones Are Alright. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis Books, 2015.

Black Religion vs. The Black Church

M: February 26: The Black Church and Its Limits

Selections from Frederick, Marla Faye. Between Sundays: Black Women's Everyday Struggles of Faith. Berkeley, Calif.: University of California Press, 2003. "Introduction" (1-18).

Taylor, James Lance. "African American Religion and Politics." In *African American Religious Cultures*, edited by Anthony B. Pinn, Stephen C. Finley, and Torin Alexander, 517–31. Santa Barbara, Calif.: ABC-CLIO, 2009.

W: February 28: New Black Gods

Selections from Weisenfeld, Judith. New World A-Coming: Black Religion and Racial Identity during the Great Migration. New York: NYU Press, 2016.

Green, Emma. "Black Activism, Unchurched." The Atlantic, March 22, 2016.

Further reading:

Selections from Fauset, Arthur Huff. Black Gods of the Metropolis: Negro Religious Cults of the Urban North. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2014 [1944].

F: March 2: Discussion Section

Part II: Organizing Spirituality

Although we often think of spirituality as an alternative to "organized religion," advocates of spirituality often have drawn on common ideas, practices, and cultural traditions. In Part II, we explore some of the modes of thought and activity that have organized American spiritualities.

Engaging Asia

M: March 5: The West Looks East

Selections from Tweed, Thomas A. The American Encounter with Buddhism, 1844-1912: Victorian Culture and the Limits of Dissent. Religion in North America. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1992.

Iwamura, Jane. "Asian Religions without Asians." Hyphen Magazine, March 25, 2011.

Further reading:

Iwamura, Jane Naomi. Virtual Orientalism: Asian Religions and American Popular Culture. New York: Oxford, 2011. Portion of Chapter 2 ("Zen's Personality: D.T. Suzuki," just 23-52).

"Doctor Strange' and the Tiresome, Stereotypical Journey East to Discover Magical Asian Awesomeness." Los Angeles Times, November 3, 2016.

W: March 7: The East Comes West

Selections from De Michelis, Elizabeth. A History of Modern Yoga: Patañjali and Western Esotericism. New York: Continuum, 2004. Portion of Chapter 3 ("Vivekananda's Esoteric Biography II: The West", 110-126).

Bardach, A. L. "What Did J.D. Salinger, Leo Tolstoy, and Sarah Bernhardt Have in Common?" Wall Street Journal, March 30, 2012.

Further reading:

Veer, Peter van der. "Spirituality in Modern Society." Social Research 76, no. 4 (December 1, 2009): 1097–1120

F: March 9: Discussion Section

Mind

M: March 12: The Technology of Mind

Selections from Whorton, James C. Nature Cures: The History of Alternative Medicine in America. New York: Oxford, 2002. Chapter 5 ("Magnetism and Mind: From Mesmerism to Christian Science," 103-130).

Selections from Leishman, Thomas Linton. Why I Am a Christian Scientist. Nashville, Tenn.: Nelson, 1963. Chapter 2 ("What Prayer Means to a Christian Scientist," 19-29); Conclusion (233-238).

W: March 14: New Thought

Hutchinson, Dawn. "New Thought's Prosperity Theology and Its Influence on American Ideas of Success." *Nova Religio: The Journal of Alternative and Emergent Religions* 18, no. 2 (November 1, 2014): 28–44.

Selections from Peale, Norman Vincent. *The Power of Positive Thinking*. New York: Fireside/Simon & Schuster, 2003 [1952].

F: March 16: Discussion Section

Body

M: March 19: Minding the Body

Selections from Singleton, Mark. *Yoga Body: The Origins of Modern Posture Practice*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2010. Chapter 4 ("India and the International Physical Culture Movement," 81-94).

Barford, Vanessa, and Lucy Townsend. "Eugen Sandow: The Man with the Perfect Body." BBC News.

W: March 21: Inventing Yoga?

Selections from Jain, Andrea R. Selling Yoga: From Counterculture to Pop Culture. New York: Oxford, 2015.

Further reading:

Selections from Singleton, Mark. *Yoga Body: The Origins of Modern Posture Practice*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2010. Chapter 6 ("Yoga as Physical Culture II: Yoga as Physical Culture II: Harmonial Gymnastics and Esoteric Dance" 143-162).

F: March 23: Discussion Section

M: March 26: No class. Spring Break.

W: March 28: No class. Spring Break.

F: March 30: No class. Spring Break.

Capitalism

M: April 2: Contemporary Capitalism

Selections from LoRusso, James Dennis. Spirituality, Corporate Culture, and American Business: The Neoliberal Ethic and the Spirit of Global Capital. London: Bloomsbury Publishing, 2017.

Gelles, David. "At Aetna, a C.E.O.'s Management by Mantra." New York Times, February 27, 2015.

Further reading:

Selections from Carrette, Jeremy R, and Richard King. Selling Spirituality: The Silent Takeover of Religion. London: Routledge, 2005. Chapter 4 ("Selling the Soul: The Business of Spirituality").

W: April 4: Consuming Spirituality

Lofton, Kathryn. "Practicing Oprah; Or, the Prescriptive Compulsion of a Spiritual Capitalism." *Journal of Popular Culture* 39, no. 4 (2006): 599–621.

Rosman, Katherine. "<u>Lululemon's Kumbaya Capitalism</u>." *The New York Times*, October 24, 2015.

F: April 6: Discussion Section

Nature

M: April 9: Communing with Nature

Selections from Mitchell, Kerry. Spirituality and the State: Managing Nature and Experience in America's National Parks. New York: NYU Press, 2016.

Further reading:

Nelson, Robert H. "Economics and Environmentalism: Belief Systems at Odds." *The Independent Review* 17, no. 1 (Summer 2012): 5–17.

Taylor, Bron Raymond. Dark Green Religion: Nature Spirituality and the Planetary Future. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2010.

W: April 11: Environmentalism and Domestic Orientalism

View: Avatar (2009)

Klassen, Chris. "Avatar, Dark Green Religion, and the Technological Construction of Nature." *Cultural Studies Review* 18, no. 2 (September 2012): 74–88.

Taylor, Bron. "Avatar and Nature Spirituality: Avatar as Rorschach"

Further reading:

Berry, Evan. Devoted to Nature: The Religious Roots of American Environmentalism. Berkeley, Calif.: University of California Press, 2015. Chapter 4 ("Recreation and Spiritual Experience," 148-176).

Erb, Cynthia. "A Spiritual Blockbuster: 'Avatar,' Environmentalism, and the New Religions." *Journal of Film and Video* 66, no. 3 (Fall 2014): 3–17.

F: April 13: Discussion Section

Countercultures

M: April 16: Seeking Spiritual Freedom

Selections from Wuthnow, Robert. After Heaven: Spirituality in America Since the 1950s. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1998. Chapter 3 ("The New Spiritual Freedom," 52-84).

Fuller, Robert C. "Drugs and the Baby Boomers' Quest for Metaphysical Illumination." *Nova Religio: The Journal of Alternative and Emergent Religions* 3, no. 1 (October 1, 1999): 100–118.

Selections from Allen Ginsberg's *Howl* (1955)

W: April 18: Mainstreaming Countercultures

Selections from Turner, Fred. From Counterculture to Cyberculture: Stewart Brand, the Whole Earth Network, and the Rise of Digital Utopianism. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2006.

"Feel the Vibe: Top 10 Metros for Alternative Spirituality." Real Estate News & Insights | realtor.com®, September 12, 2016.

F: April 20: Discussion Section

Criticisms

M: April 23: On Whiteness

Selections from Sorett, Josef. Spirit in the Dark: A Religious History of Racial Aesthetics. New York: Oxford University Press, 2016.

Narcisse, Evan. "<u>Dear Hollywood: Spiritual Dramas Aren't Just for White People</u>." io9. Accessed October 16, 2017.

W: April 25: On Appropriations

Selections from Owen, Suzanne. The Appropriation of Native American Spirituality. London: Continuum, 2008.

F: April 27: Wrap Up (Reading Period)